

Appendix II – Consultation Record as at 18 June 2018

Iwi

Iwi/hapu	Contact/role	Email	Date of contact	Contact method	Response	Comments/mitigation
Ngati Tara Tokanui	Sonny Te Karu (trustee)	tekaruharawira@gmail.com	12.12.16	Introductory letter and overview of proposal.		
	Amelia Williams (CEO)	amelia.w@vodafone.co.nz	6.06.17	Phone message requesting meeting		
“	“	“	30.06.17	Info pack, phone conversation	Generally neutral about the project. Proximity of Mangaiti Trust may present to site may present cultural sensitivity.	Busy with treaty settlements and an environmental court case so not able to allocate much focus to the proposal at present. Will be happy to consider preparing a cultural values assessment.
			1.09.17	Invitation to public information days.		
			11.09.17	Email asking if they wished to lodge a CVA.	Response (11.09.17) “I am unable to commit to a Cultural Assessment”.	
			15.05.18	Email	Asking if he would facilitate a hui involving all five Iwi to learn more about the proposal and provide feedback.	Sonny consulted the Kaumatua Kaunihera Chairperson who advised that the Iwi’s focus is on resolving some serious matters related to its Treaty claim. That is their priority at this time.
			24.05.18	Email from Glenn Starr	Thanking them for engagement to date, giving update on application filing, expressing hope that at some point a multi-Iwi hui will be possible to identify areas of common perspective, points of difference between the various hapu and possible mitigations.	
Ngati Ngahutoitoi Marae	Paora Raharaha, Chair	taratokanui@gmail.com	18.12.17	Community update plus personal email enclosing Rotokohu Q&A and Consultation Pack; inviting contact.		
	Nancy Gage	Te Moananui Flats Road Paeroa	19.12.17	Letter enclosing Rotokohu Q&A, Consultation Pack and latest Community Update; inviting contact.		
	Nick Singh	07 862 9106 haurakiholdens@hotmail.com	17.1.18	Phone call from Nick.	Pauline Clarkin attended the marae on the weekend and gave an overview of the proposal. The marae would like someone to come to a hui	Clare Bayly to attend hui at Ngahutoitoi Marae on Sunday 21 January at 11 am.

					to give more detail, enable questions and answers etc.	
			21.1.18	Attend hui at Ngahutoitoi Marae and engage in korero	Provide overview of the proposal and listen to hapu concerns.	Undertake to provide site layout so hapu can understand the location of the turbines in relation to tribal land. Also agree to participating (and facilitate if necessary) hui of all five iwi.
			23.1.18	Email to Sonny Te Karu (trustee) and Nick Singh	Enclosing site layout so they can share with their whanau to improve understanding of location of turbines in relation to tribal land.	
			11.2.18	Email from marae secretary	Hui principally of Ngahutoitoi whanau held on Sunday; generally oppose wind farm but have not stated possible mitigations.	Contacted Chair and CEO of Ngati Tara Tokanui to understand if there are possible mitigations.
			19.4.18	Email to Nick Singh	Brief update on application, asking if they still plan to hold a hui involving all five iwi, and offering any help or support.	
			24.05.18	Email from Glenn Starr	Thanking them for engagement to date, giving update on application filing, expressing hope that at some point multi-iwi hui will be possible to identify areas of common perspective, points of difference between hapu and possible mitigations.	
Ngati Tamatera	R Brownlee	PO Box 23, Paeroa	2005	Letter	Notifying desire to develop wind farm and wish to erect temporary monitoring masts at the site for up to four years. Asking if they have any objections.	
	Liane Ngamane (CEO)	Liane.ngamane@hotmail.com	12.12.16	Introductory email and overview of proposal.		
			15.03.17	Phone invitation to public meeting.	Not present at meeting	
			6.06.17	Brief phone conversation	Requested information pack before meeting	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public information days.		
			11.09.17	Email enclosing consultation pack and site layout.	.	
			10.1.18	Email from Liane	Apologising for tardiness in not responding to our contacts and confirming that Ngati Tamatera want to be engaged on the proposal from their cultural lens and context. She undertook to come back with an approximate cost and signalled that it would involve a hui to enable the proposal to be presented and any issues dealt with directly with us as applicant.	Wrote back to Liane outlining all contacts – since March last year – emphasising our intentions to lodge the application shortly, offering help with information (confirming website, photo montages etc) and to come over to Paeroa if that helps.
			10..1.18	Email from Liane	Formally advising that Ngati Tamatera want to be involved and undertake a CVA. Asking for meeting on 26 January to progress.	Express desire to engage and acknowledgement of cost around preparing CVA and agree to meeting on 26 January.
			24.1.18	Meeting with Liane Ngamane	Provide overview of the proposal and invite hui to consider CVA.	Liane said she would view the Ngati Hako CVA but said that Tamatera would have its

						own nuances which would need to be personalised in its own CVA. Agreed to keep in touch.
			24.05.18	Email from Glenn Starr	Thanking them for engagement to date, giving update on application filing, expressing hope that at some point multi-iwi hui will be possible to identify areas of common perspective, points of difference between hapu and possible mitigations.	
Ngati Hako	John (Ken) Linstead (Ch)	kenlinstead@yahoo.com PO Box 14, Paeroa	23.11.05	Letter	Notifying desire to develop wind farm and wish to erect temporary monitoring masts at the site for up to four years. Asking if they have any objections.	
	Pauline Clarkin (CEO)	hako@xtra.co.nz	12.12.16	Introductory email and overview of proposal.	Email confirming iwi will await application confirming proposed site has cultural significance to iwi.	
			13.03.17	Phone invitation to public meeting	Not present at meeting	
			6.06.17	Text requesting meeting	Agreed to meet 8 June, this was subsequently deferred to 19.06.17.	
	“		5.07.17	Email/info pack	Ngati Hako had an expectation that, four months ago, we would address issues in AEE. Offered to do a full MVA provided Ventus will fund.	Apologised for misunderstanding, wanted to start afresh. Asked for clarification of time required to develop the MVA, and cost.
	“			Copied into email to Ken Linstead	Prepared to develop a Maori Values Assessment of sites of cultural significance.	
	“		10.07.17	Email from Pauline Clarkin	Estimated it will take three weeks for Ngati Hako to research and prepare MVA at a cost of \$3000 including GST.	Replied thanking Ngati Hako, accepting time and cost and asking that we have opportunity to see, comment and their response to those comments before report is published.
			1.09.17	Invitation to public information days.		
			11.09.17	Email enquiring about progress with MVA.	CVA in progress.	
			1.11.17	Telephone call from Pauline	They have some questions relating to noise. Arranged to meet 3 pm Monday 13 November.	
			13.11.17	Meeting with Pauline Clarkin and Alice	Seeking clarity on range of issues – <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Include Te Moananui Flats Road residence in consultation – properties back onto Rotokohu Road. • Want to see photomontages. • Rotokohu means ‘valley of the mist’ so concern over impact of turbines on moving mist/fog. • Ridgeline is also sacred – seen as the connecting force/energy so iwi could be 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Contact Paora Raharaha, Chair of Ngati Ngahutoitoi Marae. • Give photomontages to James Thorp to leave at council for Pauline. • Short-term employment opportunities include construction, concrete, earthworks; medium/long term maintenance depot.

					<p>concerned about the impact of turbines near or on the ridgeline.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Want to understand employment opportunities short, medium and long term. • Questioned company ownership long term, potential for investment, likely returns. 	
			11.12.17	Email to Pauline Clarkin	Advising application will be lodged in January and asking for update on their review.	
			18.12.17	Follow-up email to Pauline Clarkin	Asking for approximate date CVA would be received.	
			10.1.18	Email to Pauline Clarkin	Asking for an update on the CVA.	
			11.1.18	Phone call from Pauline Clarkin	Ngahutoitoi Marae having a hui on Saturday to discuss proposal; Pauline will attend and will send draft of concerns/issues after.	
			18.4.18	Meeting Pauline Clarkin	Discussed the Iwi's summary CVA – emailed through.	
			24.05.18	Email from Glenn Starr	Thanking them for engagement to date, giving update on application filing, expressing hope that at some point multi-iwi hui will be possible to identify areas of common perspective, points of difference between hapu and possible mitigations.	
Ngati Maru Runanga	Nikky Fisher (CEO)	nikky@ngatimaru.iwi.nz	12.12.16	Introductory letter and overview of proposal.		
			5.07.17	Email/info pack		
			13.8.17		Nikky Turner advised Ngati Maru have an interest in the area but do not require consultation at this time. Request to be kept updated via email.	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public information days.		
			24.05.18	Email from Glenn Starr	Thanking them for engagement to date, giving update on application filing, expressing hope that at some point multi-iwi hui will be possible to identify areas of common perspective, points of difference between hapu and possible mitigations.	
Ngati Rahiri-Tumutumu	Mapuna Turner		12.12.16	Introductory letter and overview of proposal.		
			13.03.17	Phone invitation to public meeting	Not present at meeting.	
	"		6.06.17	Phone call requesting meeting.	Invitation to attend monthly hui at Tui Pa in Te Aroha on 18 June.	
	Shelley Turner	Shelley.turner@vodafone.co.nz	5.07.17	Email/info pack		
	Jill Taylor	jilltaylor@vodafone.co.nz	14.07.17	Email/info pack		
			1.09.17	Invitation to public information days.		

			11.09.17	Email requesting update on possible MVA.	Will review Ngati Hako's CVA and decide, at that point, whether they want to add to it or initiate another.	
			24.04.18	Email from Glenn Starr	Thanking them for engagement to date, giving update on application filing, expressing hope that at some point multi-iwi hui will be possible to identify areas of common perspective, points of difference between hapu and possible mitigations.	
Hauraki Maori Trust Board	David Taipari (Ch)	taipari@wave.co.nz general@hauraki.iwi.nz	2005	Meeting	Update Trust Board on the proposal to construct a wind farm and seek their advice on which Iwi should be consulted.	
			12.12.16	Email and update on proposal.		
			6.06.17	Text requesting meeting	Agreed to meet 9 June – subsequently cancelled.	
	"		21.06.17	Info pack and meeting	Recommended optimum consultation process with various iwi. Wants to be kept informed of progress.	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public information days.		
			11.04.17	Email from David Taipari	Expressing concern that an impression was given, at recent hui, that David Taipari had given list of people to contact, that this was extensive and precluded some people.	Reassurance that KWF followed David's instructions to the letter – he provided names of Iwi to contact, and their names were obtained by KWF through a website search. Only conclusion of assumption of extensive list is that the Consultation Record (in its entirety) was referred to during the hui, and had been misunderstood. Offer to write a letter/explanation to all hui; draft provided to David for signoff. Signoff not received.
			11.04.18	Email to Trust Board	Seeking advice on potential to contribute to Iwi projects or initiatives.	Advice that individual approach needed to be made to each Iwi. That the Trust Board wants to be kept informed but not directly involved.
			11.04.18	Email	David had been approached by representatives of Iwi concerned he had provided names of people to contact.	Reassured David that representatives at the hui were told that HMTB provided the names of Iwi – representative contacts subsequently located from the internet.
	John McEnteer (CEO)	johnm@hauraki.iwi.co.nz	21.06.17	Info pack and meeting	Appreciated the contact and wants to be kept informed.	
			24.05.18	Email from Glenn Starr	Courtesy update - Thanking them for engagement to date, giving update on application filing, expressing hope that at some point multi-iwi hui will be possible to identify areas of common perspective, points of difference between hapu and possible mitigations.	

Local Government

In addition to the following, all local government contacts have received all community updates.

Council	Contact/role	Email	Date of contact	Contact method	Response	Comments/mitigation
Hauraki District Council	John Tregida (Mayor)	mayor@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	2005	Letter and overview of proposal including intention to erect monitoring masts on site for up to four years.	Asked to be kept informed.	
			22.12.16	Introductory email and overview of proposal.		
			21.06.17	Info pack and meeting	Wants to be kept informed	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public info days.		
	David Fielden (Econ Dev Mgr)	David.fielden@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	21.06.17	Info pack and meeting	Wants to be kept informed.	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public info days.		
	Paula Trubshaw (Comms)	Paulat@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	19.01.17 13.03.17	Phone conversations.		
	" "		21.06.17	Info pack	Keep informed.	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public info days.		
	Mark Buttimore (iwi rep)	Mark.buttimore@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	13.03.17 16.03.17	Phone conversations.		
	"		21.06.17	Info pack and meeting.	Wants to be kept informed.	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public info days.		
	Jo Tilsley (Positively Paeroa promoter)	enquiries@paperoa.org.nz Ph 027 330 3170; 07 862 6999	21.06.17	Info pack	Keep informed particularly around public open day.	
			June 2017 .	In person	Maintain regular contact.	
	Marina Van Steenberg (planning manager_	marina@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	19.12.16	Info pack		
			1.09.17	Invitation to public info days.		
Waikato Regional Council	Alan Livingston (Chair)	Alan.livingston@waikatoregion.govt.nz	1.09.17	Info pack plus invitation to public info days.		
	Vaughan Payne (CEO)	Vaughan.payne@waikatoregion.govt.nz	1.09.17	"	Unable to attend, delegated to appropriate person within council.	
		Graeme.cooper@waikatoregion.govt.nz Mark..row@waikatoregion.govt.nz Tony.quickfall@waikatoregion.govt.nz	13.12.17	Meeting with Graeme Cooper and Mark Row (Earthworks), Tony Quickfall (RMA policy).	Consenting team requested copies of Archeology, Civil Drawings, Sediment Control and Ecology.	
Matamata-Piako District Council			2012	Various emails relating to transportation aligned to earlier project.		

			2014	Submission to Plan Change 43 – Transportation and Plan Change 44, Works and Network Utilities.		
	Jan Barnes	jbarnes@mpdc.govt.nz	1.09.17	Email outlining proposal to develop wind farm.		
	Michelle Staines-Hawthorne	Mstaines-hawthorne@mpdc.govt.nz	16.06.17	Phone conversation		
			12.07.17	Information pack and request to attend iwi rep network	Invitation to attend and speak at iwi network at 10 am on 5 September.	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public info days.		
	Suzanne Kampshot	skampshof@mpdc.govt.nz	12.07.17	Information pack and request for meeting with roading team.	Meeting scheduled for 4 August to meet with Mike Van Grootel, roading team	
			4.08.17	Meeting to understand Council requirements for traffic management plan	Council will advise requirements for specifications, dimensions etc.	
			1.09.17	Invitation to public info days.		
			6.9.17	Email from Suzanne	Council concerned about structures on Rawhiti Road. Asked VE to consider construction access to come via closest route from SH26.	
	Mike Van Grootel	mvangrootel@mpdc.govt.nz	4.08.17	“	“	
	Peter McCoskrie	pmccoskrie@mpdc.govt.nz	4.08.17	“	“	

Central Government

MP/Ministry/Dept	Contact/role	Email	Date of contact	Contact method	Response	Comments/mitigation
Lindsay Tisch	MP for Waikato (<2017)	Lindsay.tisch@parliament.govt.nz	1.09.17	Email invitation to public info days.		
Tim Van de Molen	MP Waikato (>2017)	Tim.vandemolenmp@parliament.govt.nz				
Hon Nanaia Mahuta	MP Hauraki Waikato	Nanaia.mahuta@parliament.govt.nz	"	"		
Hon Judith Collins	Minister Energy & Resources (<2017)	Judith.collins@parliament.govt.nz	22.11.16	Introductory email and overview of proposal.	9.02.17 – reply encouraging proposal and apologising for not being able to attend public engagement meeting.	
Hon Dr Megan Woods	Minister Energy & Resources (>2017)	Megan.woods@parliament.govt.nz				
DOC	Jessyca Bernard, Tauranga BOP DOC	jbernard@doc.govt.nz	23.11.05	Letter	Notifying proposal to construct wind farm and wish to erect temporary monitoring mast on site for up to four years.	
			June /July 2017	Dropped into office and left several phone messages	Not present / no response.	
			20.07.2017	Email/info pack	24.07.2017 - Said she will enlist permissions and biodiversity experts to give specific comment. DOC may have concerns regarding the ecological effects on native birds and bats (with regard to strike). Interference of landscape value and aesthetics also a concern. She will be in touch as soon as she has further advice.	
			1.09.17	Email invitation to public info days.		Provide copy of Kessels Report and initiate discussion?
			9.11.17	Telephone conversation	Jessica Bernard advised she requested assistance from DOC BOP's internal team regarding our request to discuss the possibility of mitigation of effects through sponsorship, a support programme or other means.	
			20.11.2017	Phone conversation, requesting management structure at DOC BOP.	Sent us the required information ie area manager contacts.	
		thames@doc.govt.nz; taurangainfo@doc.govt.nz	18.10.17	Email	Advising we want to provide DOC with a copy of the Kessels Report and discuss initiating/supporting a	

					preservation programme for native bats.	
		lbarea@doc.govt.nz gsilver@doc.govt.nz	13.12.17	Meeting with Laurence Barea (biodiversity and offsets specialist) and Graeme Silver (Planning Manager)	Focus on Stage 1.	
NZ Forest & Bird		office@forestandbird.org.nz	18.10.17	Email	“ “	
		Jess Winchester – Relationships Manager j.winchester@forestandbird.org.nz / 04 801 2219	8.11.17	Phone conversation	Had a conversation about possible mitigation measures VE could collaborate with F&B in conjunction with its Kaimai Mamaku Campaign	Open to conversation
		Rebecca Stirnemann – Central North Island Manager R.Stirnemann@forestandbird.org.nz	11.05.18	Phone conversation	Update on project. Enquiring about potential for KWF to provide financial support for projects. Shared Kessels Ecology Report.	Wants to be kept informed of application timeframe.
			16.05.18	Email	Copy of Kessels Ecology Report.	Rebecca undertook to share the Report with her team and respond with feedback and possible mitigations.
Green Party	Scott Summerfield	Scott.summerfield@greens.org.nz	3.07.17	Website comment	Email/copy consultation pack, invitation feedback.	Supportive. Wants to understand impact on birdlife. Promoting clean energy benefits to region.
			1.09.17	Email invitation to public info days.		
Paeroa Highland Games	Margarete Ford	Wayne.n@xtra.co.nz	6.6.18	Meeting	Discuss potential sponsorship of Highland Games should proposal proceed.	

Land owners – wind farm

In addition to the following, land owners have received all community updates.

Name	Phone	Email	Date of contact/s	Contact method	Comments/resonse
Maureen Jackson	07 862 7719 027 293 9628	mandrjackson@xtra.co.nz	22.12.16	Email	Request for more regular updates involving all three land owners. Initiate schedule of update meetings.
			<March 2017	Numerous phone calls, emails.	
			March 2017	Tirohia info meeting	
			21.06.17	Update meeting, copy of information pack.	
			21.08.17	Update newsletter advising progress with application, upcoming public information days etc.	
			5.09.17	Update meeting	
			11.12.17	Copy of Rotokohu/Thorp Road Q&A.	
			January 2018	Email, updating progress with application.	
			30 April	Update email	
Mat Denize	027 293 3233	matdenize@yahoo.com	"	"	"
Richard Thorp		richarddeidrethorp@gmail.com	"	"	

Community engagement

Paeroa business and special interest community

In addition to the following, the Paeroa business community have received all community updates.

Organisation	Contact/role	Email	Date of contact	Contact method	Response	Comments/mitigation
Leach Tirohia Quarry	Eric Souchon (CEO)	erics@hgleach.co.nz	21.06.17	Info pack and meeting	Supportive, wants to be kept informed.	
Business after 5 network	Jo Tilsley, Positive Paeroa	enquiries@paeroa.org.nz	15.08.17	Glenn Starr presentation, Q&A	General interest.	
Pukorokoro Miranda Shorebird Centre	Keith Woodley (Manager), Gillian Vaughan (Chair) Will Perry (Secretary)		19.05.18	Meeting.	Gain insight to Centre activities, provide update on KWF and share copy of Kessels Ecology Report. Enquire about need for funding	Centre is aware of minor risk to SIPO population and would welcome support for project, in particular ongoing maintenance of planned silt pond development and/or contribute to research of banded dotterel.
Hauraki Rail Trail	Diane Drummond, General Manager	diane@haurakirailtrail.co.nz	18.4.18	Meeting to canvas potential for KWF to collaborate with and extend Hauraki Rail Trail.	Regardless of access points, the terrain of the site of the wind farm put it 'outside' the scope of being 'a great ride' but there may be potential for any bike access on the farms to be regarded as a Heartland Ride.	HRT want to be kept informed of the progress of the wind farm, believing there could be some potential to collaborate to extend or enhance cycling and walking activities in the greater Paeroa region.
NZ Walking Access Commission	John Gibbs, Regional Field Advisor, BOP	John.gibbs@walkingaccess.govt.nz	28.2.18	Email enquiring potential for incorporating Wrights Road (formerly a historic Maori trail) into the Government network of walking trails.	Appreciated contact and insight to Wrights Road and asked to be kept informed of progress.	
Piako Soaring Club NZ Hang Gliding and Paragliding Club	Tim Bromhead, Piako Gliding Club Rick Hawkeswood, NZ Hang Gliding and Paragliding	021 217 9049 021 682 766	May - June 2017	Several conversations and meetings with Glenn Starr.	Explain ambit of KWF and better understand needs of paragliders, hang-gliders and fixed wing gliders.	Organised for Energy 3, wind energy specialists, to determine the likely turbulent effect behind wind turbines at key wind speeds that the soaring disciplines need and investigate a possible mitigation plan to allow the soaring amenity to continue to be used.

Engagement with Paeroa residents

Community Update newsletter

Community Update newsletters have been emailed and distributed to 400 x RD 3 Paeroa and RD 2 Te Aroha residents as follows -

- 10 February 2017
- 2 April 2017
- 4 June 2017
- 18 December 2017

Public Information Day 16 March 2017, Tirohia Hall

Promotion:

- Door knocking 19 January 2017/information brochure
- Public notice, local media

Attendance numbers: Approximately 60 people.

Contacts/concerns/issues

Name	Date of contact	Method of contact	Issue/concern	Response	Comments/mitigation
Brian Mayne, Paeroa Golf Club	23.01.17	Phone call	Invitation to info day	Positive and supportive.	
Julian Mason	16.3.17	Julian@techmason.co.nz	Interest		
George Avery	"	649 Rawhiti Rd. RD2, Te-Aroha / 07-862-8028	Interest		
Mandy & Paul Tormey	"	paultormey@gmail.com ; mandytormey@gmail.com	Interest	Subsequent email expressing concern about noise.	Advice that acoustics assessment will be conducted.
April Mudford	"	181C Thorp Rd. RD3, 07-862-8120, aprilmudfordnz@gmail.com	Concerned as residence in close proximity to site and husband's ashes scattered on site of one of the proposed turbines.	We understand that people may have emotional connections to the land that we are proposing for the wind farm.	3.07.17 – email confirming relocation of turbine in question.
Raewyn Leonhart	"	Rex.raewyn@xtra.co.nz , 454 Rotokohu Rd. RD3	General interest.		
Hannah and Brent Jackson		castle@salient.net.nz	Jacksons are planning to develop a retreat on Old Rotokohu Road and are concerned about possible impacts of wind farm.	Advised that range of assessments being carried out.	
Zen & Amy Timmons	"	569 Rotokohu Rd, 027-8049068 hydradye@slingshot.co.nz	Concerned about noise, visual & property values. Bought a property in a serene location and want the area to stay that way. Opposed. Believe sound and intra-sound vibrations from turbines not conducive to health.		
Ken Besli	"	07 862 8617	Earthmoving company – general interest.		
Pete Martin	"	731 Maratoto Rd, 07-862-8700, pete-m@ihug.co.nz	Paragliding club – concerned about possible recreational impacts.	Agree to meet the club to understand concerns.	
Kelby, Lyn & Ed Stewart	"	6260 SH26, RD3, Paeroa, 07-862-8748, info@kelby.co.nz ; e_l_stewart@hotmail.com	"	"	
General comment from meeting and door-knocking			Noise & "infra-noise" - impact on health; question whether "amphitheatre" at the end of Rotokohu and Thorp Rds will make the noise louder?	All issues are addressed in the Q&A published on the Kaimai Wind website.	Q&A developed based on questions and concerns raised at public meeting – published on Kaimai Wind website.

			Effect on property values; visual impacts; traffic volumes and management - effect on the condition of the road. Ecology – birdlife and bees. Benefits to the Paeroa community. Light pollution at night time. Potential for windfarm to expand n future.		
Alastair Sorely	12.04.17	Alastair.sorely@goldpeg.com	Email expressing concern in relation to fauna and proximity of proposal to Kaimai-Mamaku Conservation Park.	Advised that extensive multi-year assessment being carried out in relation to ecological impacts.	
Robyn, Gliding Club	5.04.17	Phone call	Gliding and Soaring Club want meeting to discuss issues relating to recreational use.	18.5.17 Meeting and subsequent discussions with Piako Soaring Club, Waharoa and commercial pilots to understand concerns.	Agreed to reduce the number of turbines from 26 to 24 to accommodate flight paths. Also indicated agreement to shutting down specific turbines during gliding competitions.
Ronald Elliott	4.07.17	Website contact	Complaint re insufficient communication.	Reassurance that all residents within 2+km radius of site will be communicated via flyers distributed by NZ Post RD.	

Public information days 6 and 7 September 2017

Promotion:

- Invitation flyer distributed to around 760 residents within 2+km radius of Tirohia/site of the proposed wind farm.
- Email invitation to all iwi and stakeholders.
- Media article.

Attendance numbers: Around 45 residents.

Contacts/concerns/issues

Name	Date	Contact	Issue/concern	Response	Comments/mitigation
Barry Bain	5.09.17	027 2664212	Noise – discussed with Stephen Totara on Wright Rd – needs advice on extent of cuts + visual impact.	Stephen Chiles clarified noise effects.	
Barbara Loeliger	“	bloeliger@gmail.com	Interested in updates, generally in favour. Recommendation - Wrights Road is adjacent to a paper road, which used to be available for walking /cycling. Recommended this facility be developed to enable people (residents & tourists) to do the “circle” and get closer to the turbines aka Te Uku.		
Maria van Steenberg	“	marina@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	Planner with HDC – suggest pre-lodgement meeting		
Peter Thom (group manager, planning)	“	Peter.thon@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	“ “		
Ralph Gore, fixed wing glider, Piako Gliding Club	“	Gore.family@xtra.co.nz	Questioned downwind effect, need to involve CAA? Requested update on consultant’s report when published.		
Langley Cavers	“	langley.cavers@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	CEO HDC – general interest		
Dick Worley and Ian Coats Thames Valley Pistol Club	“	nicu308@aol.com ; coatsi@xnet.co.nz	Concern about proximity of shooting range on Hill Road with turbines – ie 2.8km to nearest turbine. Wanted to understand if there was possible risk to safety.	Subsequently emailed confirming that, after discussions with Glenn Starr and further research, they do not have an issue.	
Anne-Marie Spicer HDC Councillor, Waihi	“	Annemarie.spicer@hauraki-dc.govt.nz	General interest		
Noel Cormtry, Rotorua	“	Noel.cormtry@gmail.com	General interest – cycles in the area		

Aaron Darby	“	aarondarby@gmail.com	Paragliding pilot, general interest. Supportive.		
Eric Souchon CEO HG Leach	“	erics@hgleach.co.nz	Supportive.		
Viv Simmons	“	021 125 9812	Resident Hill Road. Supportive. Interested in traffic management Rawhiti Road.	Shown route map; general discussion.	
Keith Walker	“	Keroy2@xtra.co.nz 579 Rotokohu Road	Concerned about visual impact, property values. Wants to see Colliers' report on property values, photomontage P and receive email summary timeline.	Suggested cottage meeting with Rotokohu Valley residents to share Colliers Report and hear their concerns.	24.9.17 Emailed project timeline. Confirmed cottage meeting will be held – organising with James Thorp.
James Thorp HDC Councillor and resident Rotokohu Road	5.09.17	thorpwhanau@xtra.co.nz ; 021-180-8673	Has bee hives, concerned about possible impact on bees from airflow. Unofficial spokesperson for 17 land owners in valley who are “not happy, but this is fear of the unknown.” Asked for noise monitoring at specific houses on Rotokohu Rd – consult with locals at cottage mtg about optimum location.	As above for Walker - organise cottage meeting for 17 land owners in the valley when values report available.	24.9.17 Emailed James Thorp asking him to recommend location, date, time and agenda items. 18.10.17 Phone call from James suggesting Paeroa Golf Club best venue, mid week, around 7 pm, duration 1 hour and most residents need one week's notice.
Toby Adams Deputy Mayor HDC	“	toby.adams@auraki-dc.govt.nz	General interest		
Jacki & Dennis Baker	6.09.17	07-862-7617	Supportive		
Robbie & Rae Cummings	“	Robbie.rae1958@gmail.com	Concerned about use of Rotokohu Rd for large trucks and for maintenance	Shown route map, general discussion about traffic management.	
Megan Bruce	“	021-072-2412 megsta23@hotmail.com	Very supportive		
Simon & Sarah Hill		021-173-4545	Concerned about noise and visual impacts.	Explanation of noise, and photomontages illustrate visual impacts.	
Kevin Sharp		027-495-4420	Concerned about traffic issues on Rotokohu Road	Invite to Rotokohu cottage meeting.	
David Fitzdeli		07 862 8607	General interest		
Ross Harris			General interest		
Mat Denize			Property owner – interested to see how info days going.		
Henry Clubb		07-862-7035 / henryclubb@gmail.com ; 511 Rotokohu Rd	Concerned about noise and visual impacts. Wants more information.	Invite to Rotokohu cottage meeting.	

Simon Parker		0217-8635624	Supportive.		
Bill Tissingh		021-862-871	Concerned about noise and intrusion but generally supportive.	Shown and discuss noise impacts poster.	
Melanie Camoin, Reporter Waihi Leader		021-820-942 / melanie.camoin83@gmail.com ; Melanie.Camoin@waihileader.co.nz	Interested, writing update article		
Wendy Harris, senior planner HDC		07-862-5051	Interested.		
Gordon Harris		07-863-8076	Supportive		
Jackson Greenwall Planner, HDC		027-332-4670	Interested		
Krystal Walton Planner, HDC		027-366-9530	Interested		
Debbie & Adrian Baxter		07-862-7103 / adriananddebbie@xtra.co.nz	Live on Rotokohu Rd – concerned about noise, visual, traffic. Frustrated. Want more communication on the proposal	Discussion re noise (poster), visuals and traffic management. Invite to Rotokohu cottage meeting	
Warren Coffey Waikato RC		021 880 293 Warren.Coffey@waikatoregion.govt.nz	Concerned about noise – wants noise monitoring on North East side of Rotokohu Rd.	Invite to Rotokohu cottage meeting	Talk with residents about optimum site for noise monitoring.
Clive McDonald		027 497 0620	Interested		
Gus Van Denook		07-862-7552 gus.vandentook@xtra.co.nz	Interested		
Paul & Mandy Tormey		07 862 6238/021 810 615 paultormey@gmail.com	Concerned about noise	Explanation of noise levels associated with turbines.	
Colin Sutherland			Interested, supportive		

'Meet and Greet' for residents of Rotokohu and Thorp Roads

Monday 13 November 2017

Friday 2 November

Invitations delivered, via rural courier, to all residents of Rotokohu and Thorp Roads

Personal emails sent to all residents of both roads who attended the Information Days in Paeroa.

Attendees (24)

Name	Email
Simon and Sarah Hill	Thehills79@gmail.com
April Mudford	aprilmudfordnz@gmail.com
Bev and Kevin Sharp	Kevin.sharp@xtra.co.nz
Lyn Pullan, Paeroa Golf Club	pullanslj@gmail.com
Paul and Mandy Tormey	Paul.tormey@gmail.com
Debbie and Adrian	Adriananddebbie@xtra.co.nz
James and Gaye Thorp	thorpwhanau@xtra.co.nz
Ron and ? Elliott	Inline24v@gmail.com
Keith and Robyn Walker	Keroy2@xtra.co.nz ; rnawalker@gmail.com
John and Barb Frater	barbfrater@xtra.co.nz
Amy and Zen Timmons	hydradye@slingshot.co.nz
Henry and Rebecca Clubb	beckclubb@gmail.com
Mark Ofsoske	fielfenfarms@xtra.co.nz
Z Timmins	zenithtimmins@hotmail.com

Summary of concerns, actions and possible mitigations –

James Thorp spoke for the group saying they were concerned that the current position of the turbines 'surround' them in the valley. They would have been happier had the project been on the Te Aroha side of the range.

Concern/issue	Answer/Action	Mitigation
Level of noise – asked if guarantee could be given in relation to actual levels?	Consent conditions will require that sound levels do not exceed the noise limits in NZS 6808. Comprehensive commissioning measurements also required by conditions will ensure these limits are not exceeded.	Suggested that VE volunteer and commit to consent conditions setting noise limits and requiring compliance measurements.
Property values – question relevance of Colliers Report given it is largely based on overseas experience.	The Colliers' report was holistic looking at the impact of controversial developments across New Zealand eg corrections facilities and prisons, proximity to earthquake fault lines, power pylons, psychiatric housing, detention centres and the Hau Nui Wind Farm in Martinborough. Over the passage of time, research and an Environment Court ruling shows that "property values may fall for a short while but this is not sustained and after a matter of months prices return to normal".	
What turbines have been removed from the original proposal?	Reduced from 26 to 24. Central, between Rotokohu Road and lower ridge and north end in response to concerns expressed by glider community and Tirohia School (respectively).	

Questioned how many turbines at maximum and minimum height. Concern over prominence of maximum height turbines. Concern that this constitutes 'visual pollution'.	Seven lower height turbines on the ridgeline, and 17 maximum height turbines on the lower ridgeline. Height and placement a response to analysis of wind conditions ie to optimise the wind resource.	
Questioned scale of photomontages.	The photomontages are to scale.	
Traffic on Rotokohu Road – what is the predicted traffic flow on the road, what is the nature of those vehicles, what effect will it have on the road surface, on local users and residents (like school children) – and how will this be managed.	VE is proposing that extra-heavy transportation be limited to one route – Rawhiti Road – to contain effects and need for bridge and roadside upgrades. Eight to 16t truck units may use Rotokohu Road and Rawhiti Road. Lighter traffic – utes, cars and light trucks (less than 8t) – may use Rotokohu Road which is convenient for staff accommodation and supply of equipment from outlets in Paeroa.	
Wanted clarification on the route the turbines will take from Tauranga to the wind farm. Wanted reassurance that they will not go down Rotokohu Road.	It is proposed that the turbines will be transported to site via Rawhiti Road.	
Wanted to know the timeline for the application and how to lodge a response.	At this stage, it is hoped to lodge the application in January 2018. Full details will be published on the Hauraki District Council website including information on how to lodge a response.	
Wanted to know how they could access full expert reports.	Once the application is filed with the Hauraki District Council, all reports will be available online, to the public.	
Wanted to be notified when the application is filed.	Ventus Energy will email all residents who attended meeting when the application has been filed.	
Wanted specifics of bird and bat monitoring.	Detailed in the Report summary (below) which was provided to residents at the meeting.	.
How many wind farms are in as close proximity to communities as Rotokohu Road will be ie perception they will be surrounded 180 degrees by turbines.	Every site has unique aspects which distinguish it from others – that is why specialist, objective modelling is undertaken. The NZWEA provides a good resource for wind farms in NZ, including a regularly-updated googlemap of proposed, consented and constructed windfarms - http://www.windenergy.org.nz/wind-energy/nz-windfarms	
Concern that 'being surrounded by turbines' will reduce the desirability and value of their properties.	Refer question/answer above in relation to the impact of 'other than residential' developments on property values.	
Noise – is there difference in decibel level and tone between 90m and 180m rotations?	It is assumed "rotations" means "rotors" – i.e. wind turbine blades. Yes - There are differences between different size wind turbines. When comparing modern designs, a single large wind turbine produces more sound than a single small wind turbine. However, a single large wind turbine produces less sound than multiple small wind turbines that would be required to generate the same electrical power. Wind turbine rotation speeds are limited by the speed of the blade tip. A larger wind turbine therefore rotates at a slower speed than a small turbine, altering the timing of the blade swish heard when standing close to turbines.	N/A

	Noise effects vary between specific sites and are not universally better or worse with larger or smaller wind turbines.	
Noise – concern that the valley is an amphitheatre which will magnify the noise of the turbines.	In rural valleys people often refer to experiencing ‘amphitheatre’ effects. In many cases this relates to the fact that the area is quiet at times so sounds from surrounding activities are still audible at a significant distance. Another reason is that sheltered valleys can support the development of temperature inversions, under which condition sound propagation is enhanced. However, with respect to wind farms, strong temperature inversions only develop in stable air conditions which can only exist with low wind speeds when wind farms do not operate. They will hear the turbines at times and that will be a change to their environment. The turbines will only be at a relatively low sound level and will not interfere with activities, but we need to front up to the fact there will be some change in amenity.	Suggest Ventus Energy includes a compliance measurement position in Rotokohu Valley (indicatively at 579 Rotokohu Road subject to landowner agreement).
Is Ventus Energy conducting an assessment on ultra-low frequencies?	No specific assessment is intended for ultra-low frequency sound (“infrasound”) International literature shows that wind turbines do not generate infrasound above levels that are commonly found in the environment, and there is no evidence of effects from infrasound.	N/A
Will Venus Energy remain the operator/owner of the wind farm or will it be sold?	Ventus Energy is a private company. Glenn Starr’s role, as a risk project manager, is to get offers on all elements involved in the development of the wind farm ie turbine supply etc, and then attract investment into the project. He then has the opportunity to sell down his rights to the project company. Currently he holds 100% and envisages he could sell down to around 5%.	
If there is a new owner in the future, will this affect/compromise the consents?	The resource consents apply to the wind farm, not the organisation which made the application, so the consents remain in force over the site and would not be affected by a change of operator.	
Wanted guarantee that no more turbines will be built on this site.	The 24 turbine layout has been optimised to realise the potential wind resource on this site, and there is no room for more turbines on the site.	
Wanted specifics of where and when noise monitoring was conducted.	Monitoring in March 2017 was conducted at 181A Thorp Road and 500 Rawhiti Road. This was to gain an appreciation of the existing environment used in conjunction with site observations. Full details are included in the assessment report.	Further baseline measurements for establishing noise limits will be required prior to construction, and compliance measurements will be required when turbines start operating. These additional measurements will be undertaken at three representative locations, which are proposed to be at 181E Thorp Road, 680 Rawhiti Road and 579 Rotokohu Road, if access is agreed by respective landowners. If access is not agreed alternative locations will be used.
Were different wind conditions/weather factored into the noise readings?	Yes – Sound level measurements are all analysed relative to the measured wind speed and direction in each 10 minute period during the survey. This is required by NZS 6808.	Baseline and compliance measurements will be analysed with respect to wind speeds and directions as required by NZS 6808.
Want to visit an operating wind farm. Can this be arranged?	The closest wind farm to Paeroa is at Te Uku near Raglan. Ventus Energy, as a potential competitor, cannot get group access but the walk up to the turbines is open for the general public.	

Questioned why spiral turbines are not being used.	Spiral turbines are considered to be more suited to smaller blocks than large scale wind farms.	
Is it possible to conduct an acoustics plan?	Yes – prior to construction a prediction report in accordance with NZS 6808 will be prepared to confirm the sound from the final turbine type and layout (unless it is identical to the current assessment). A compliance assessment report will also be prepared once the wind farm is operating and will be submitted to the Council.	Suggested that Ventus Energy volunteer and commit to consent conditions requiring a prediction report and a compliance assessment report to be submitted to Hauraki District Council.
Will Ventus Energy consider acoustics plantings?	Planting has negligible effect on measured sound levels, although can reduce the perception of sound.	

Hui at Ngahutoitoi Marae, 21 January 2018

Clare Bayly representing Ventus Energy

Summary of concerns

- General opposition to any development overlooking or adjacent to tribal land.
- Urupa (burial sites) in random spots across the top of Rotokohu mountain, most marked by a stone. They conceded, however, that these are restricted to their land and it is unlikely any are on privately owned land.
- Impact of turbines on the mist – Maori regard the mist as kehua (ghosts of their ancestors). They fear that the turbines will change the mist pattern.
- They also have concerns about the vibrational aspects of the turbines – ie the depth at which the bases are anchored to the land.

Consensus that Ngahutoitoi should convene a hui of all iwi/marae on Sunday 11 February (at Ngahutoitoi Marae) to discuss the proposal, to either join or support Ngati Hako's submission and/or add their own perspective/nuances.

In attendance

Name	Physical address	PO Box	Telephone
Nick Singh	haurakiholdens@hotmail.com		07 862 9106
Sonny Te Karu	tekaruharawira@gmail.com		
Meralda Walters	100 Ngahutoitoi Marae Road, Paeroa	PO Box 66, Paeroa	
Caroline Karu	98 Ngahutoitoi Marae Road, Paeroa.	PO Box 181, Paeroa	
Penelope Te Karu	19 Corbett Road, Paeroa		
Rachell Te karu	305d Willoughby Street, Thames		
Roxanne Te Moananui	6 Porritt Street, Paeroa		
Joel Williams	1 Menzies Place, Paeroa		
Lillian Taiawa	5 Brennan Street, Paeroa		07 862 6840
Nancy Gage		PO Box 190, Paeroa 3640	027 480 8055
Ani Reta	20 Town Road, Kerepehi		07 867 6731
Margaret Goodam	2 Shoalhaven Street, Paeroa		07 862 6272
Queenie Wickliffe	6 Miller Avenue, Paeroa		021 081 19743
Myra Hemara	6 Miller Avenue, Paeroa		021 084 52947
Valmai McLeod	4 Davies Street, Paeroa		07 862 8992
Helen Crown	Opposed		
Marion Te Moananui	"		022 352 1588
Kahu Pokiha	"		
Naomi Singh-Wickliffe	"		07 862 7909
Bella Singh	"		07 862 7909
Amelia Briggs Wickliffe	"		07 862 7909

Pae Ahi	“		
Caliais Walters Singh	“		07 862 9106
Jewels Raharaha	“		020 405 25723

Kaimai Wind website www.kaimaiwind.nz

The Kaimai Wind website provided the general public with easy access to up-to-date information on the proposal, encouraging them to register interest or raise questions which were all answered personally and added, where appropriate, to the online Q&A. The following people registered their interest during 2017 :

rodcoe@outlook.com
robbie.rae@netsmart.net.nz
lucyandtim@gmail.com
alastair.sorley@goldpeg.com
ddi.hartley@gmail.com
dan.tombleson@linetechconsulting.com
scott@mcleod.nz
jkm@johnmacrae.co.nz
ralphgore766@gmail.com
clive3@slingshot.co.nz
drgthorne@gmail.com
cakaru@gmail.com
russellkaru@xtra.co.nz
eungatimaru@wave.co.nz
ashburnstud@xtra.co.nz
dave.dennison@xnet.co.nz
julian@techmason.co.nz
pete-m@ihug.co.nz
castle@salient.net.nz
sam.lowry@aurecongroup.com
thehills79@gmail.com
neil@kaweraueng.co.nz
nick.hawkeswood@ihug.co.nz
info@glidingmatamata.co.nz
rbritton@wave.co.nz
bgray@xtra.co.nz
julian@techmason.co.nz
tim@pear.co.nz
kelly.mccabe78@gmail.com
shonar@pacifecon.co.nz
rick.hawkeswood@ihug.co.nz
info@kelby.co.nz
inline24@clear

grenville@nzwea.org.nz
william.sd.diana@gmail.com
henrydumbleton@gmail.com
pipit@xtra.co.nz
bloeliger@gmail.com
Peter.thon@hauraki-dc.govt.nz
Gore.family@xtra.co.nz
nicu308@aol.com
coatsi@xnet.co.nz
Noel.cormtry@gmail.com
aarondarby@gmail.com
keroy2@xtra.co.nz
thorpwhanau@xtra.co.nz
Robbie.rae1958@gmail.com
megsta23@hotmail.com
adriananddebbie@xtra.co.nz
david@puketiro.co.nz
doingalittlebit@gmail.com

Media

In addition to all community updates, media have been communicated with as follows :

Media	Journalist	Email	Phone	Contact/date
Waihi Leader		news@waihileader.co.nz Melanie.Camoin@waihileader.co.nz		20.01.17 media release 30.6.17 info pack 1.09.17 email invitation to Paeroa info days. 11.09.17 media statement re Paeroa info days.
Waikato Times (Fairfax media)	Andrea Fox	Andrea.fox@fairfax.co.nz		August 2017 – feature article on Mat Denize’s farm with emphasis on why it was the site of the KWF ie rationale, support etc. Article contained specifics of wind farm – size of the turbines, horsepower, height and number of turbines etc.
Hauraki Herald	Jill Cleave	Jill.cleave@fairfaxmedia.co.nz		“
BOP Times	Carmen Hall	Carmen.hall@bayofplentytimes.co.nz		“
	Anna Whyte	Anna.whyte@bayofplentytimes.co.nz		“
NZ Herald/NZME		Peter.tiffany@nzme.co.nz		“
Piako Post		Katrina.tanirau@fairfaxmedia.co.nz ; Mike.bain@fairfaxmedia.co.nz		“
Nga Iwi FM		Admin@ngaiwifm.co.nz		“ 16-17.03.17 talked on Nga Iwi FM both before the public meeting and the next day on the morning show